



Important note: *To be completed with reference to the Reporting Guidance Notes for Project Leaders: it is expected that this report will be about 10 pages in length, excluding annexes*

Submission Deadline: 30th April

IWT Challenge Fund Project Information

| | |
|---|--|
| Project Reference | IWT 015 |
| Project Title | A recipe for reducing ivory consumption in China |
| Country/ies | China |
| Contract Holder Institution | Wildlife Conservation Society |
| Partner institutions | Beijing Normal University, China Wildlife Conservation Association |
| IWT Grant Value | 238,891 |
| Start/end dates of project | 15 th April 2015 / 15 th September 2017 |
| Reporting period (e.g. April 2015-Mar 2016) and number (e.g. Annual Report 1,2,3) | April 2015 – March 2016 Annual report Number 1 |
| Project leader name | Dr. Aili Kang |
| Project website | www.baohu.org |
| Report author(s) and date | Rachel Hemingway 20 th April 2016 |

1. Project Rationale

The illegal killing of elephants for ivory remains the largest threat to elephant survival with poaching rates in 2014 continuing to exceed birth rates. Tackling the issue effectively requires a full supply chain approach from source to market, addressing both enforcement and demand. While demand exists for ivory there will always be those willing to provide the supply.

This project will focus on reducing demand for illegal ivory in China through targeted behaviour and policy change approaches. Poaching of elephants is driven by demand for ivory products in Asia, particularly China. This demand is fuelled in part by the perception of prestige associated with owning ivory, as a ‘precious and rare’ commodity ivory has become desirable to an increasing number of middle class consumers. Research has shown that while there is a high level of awareness that ivory comes from dead elephants; this has not significantly reduced demand. The same survey revealed that many consumers will only stop buying ivory when it becomes illegal or more difficult to purchase, requiring a strengthened policy response from government agencies.

The human communities most negatively impacted by the illegal wildlife trade as those in low-income source countries in Africa. Illegal ivory trade chains are linked with international organised crime, corruption, bribery and blackmail in every affected source, transit and market country, and loss of key species and resources in source countries. Low income communities in source countries depend on freely available natural resources and healthy ecosystem functions to provide healthy, productive soil and clean water for livelihoods and farming. Elephants are vital in creating the conditions for productive ecosystems as well as offering opportunities for tourism. Losing elephant populations to poaching undermines these opportunities for economic wellbeing and deprives low income countries and communities with

access to their national natural resource base. Women are particularly affected due to their important household provisioning role in many source countries providing food and water for family groups. Healthy ecosystems support this role through productive soils, pollination services and providing a natural and free safety net for households to use.

2. Project Partnerships

Beijing Normal University (BNU) College of Life Sciences (CLS) is the principal partner in the *economic study of the ivory trade*, incorporated into Output 3 of this IWT project. BNU CLS is the co-Principal Investigator (co-PI) for the larger, linked ivory research program undertaken by WCS and BNU and is therefore fully engaged as an equal partner in project planning and decision making. BNU CLS has taken responsibility for designing and managing research into the perception of the main ivory industry actors regarding the proposed ban on ivory trading and potential compensation plans considered by the Chinese government. As a result of the collaboration for this IWT project, BNU and WCS have expanded our institutional collaboration to joint government capacity building efforts across China and designing a larger national longitudinal study into the prices of illegal and legal ivory in the wake of the announcement of a government ban on domestic ivory trade (jointly with the International Fund for Animal Welfare).

The China Wildlife Conservation Association (CWCA) is a Chinese-government supported NGO hosted by the State Forestry Administration with over 30 years of experience in education and sensitization campaigns in China and an extensive network of 773 local branches and over 3,450,000 members and supporters. CWCA is a strategic partner for ensuring a successful implementation of this ivory demand reduction project through supporting government and membership action. During this project period CWCA has worked with WCS to design and deliver targeted offline behaviour change and awareness raising campaigns in Beijing and Guangxi province. WCS and CWCA have a long term collaborative relationship on multiple aspects of wildlife protection in China including through our work on enhancing law enforcement and intelligence gathering in South China.

3. Project Progress

This IWT funded project has made excellent progress during the reporting period. All outcome and output indicators designed to track progress for this project are on track with many metrics being exceeded.

Over the past twelve months WCS has successfully leveraged the power of social media to reach more than 17 million potential ivory consumers across China with targeted messaging to undermine the demand for ivory, interacted with over a hundred thousand netizens in the biggest ivory consumption centres in China and secured the public pledges to reject ivory of thousands of Chinese people who used social media to call on their peers to do the same. WCS China has also supported continued high level ivory policy dialogue through securing the issue of illegal wildlife trade on the agendas of high level international bilateral meetings and leveraged our strong political connections within China to deliver clear and specific policy recommendations on implementing an effective domestic ivory ban to the main policy making body. Additionally WCS China has successfully cooperated with TRAFFIC, WildAid, IFAW and TNC in China over the past year to deliver joint campaigns, undertake targeted research on ivory and leverage the combined reach of our social and traditional media platforms.

2015 has seen a significant growth in momentum both within China and internationally in recognition of the crisis facing elephant populations in Africa. There have been a number of high profile statements from the USA and China that domestic ivory markets will be eliminated and other countries (such as Thailand), are increasing ivory trade restrictions.

This is very positive and the momentum must be encouraged and maintained by high level political engagement and continued support for NGO activities. However, the publicity associated with extinction is also serving to increase the perception of rarity and value associated with ivory as well as inform potential consumers that access to ivory is likely to become increasingly restricted in the near future – thus potentially stimulating demand. As such efforts along the supply chain from source to market must be maintained if the threat to elephants is to be successfully addressed.

3.1 Progress in carrying out project activities

Output 1: A greater number of Chinese consumers perceive ivory to be an undesirable product and engage in anti-ivory campaigns to support government action

Activity 1.1

Design innovative interactive social media campaigns which are tailored for use through portable devices and promote and capture direct public commitment not to bring ivory home

Progress

This activity has been fully executed in the manner and timeframe planned. During this project period WCS and CWCA have designed and delivered 4 online and social media behaviour change campaigns targeting four high-risk consumer groups and securing thousands of public commitments to not bring ivory home. These campaigns were delivered through social media platforms such as WeChat (similar to WhatsApp /Facebook), Weibo (similar to Twitter) and Shouhudaxiang. WCS China designed Shouhudaxiang <http://www.shouhudaxiang.org/>¹ specifically to capture public engagement in and commitment to elephant protection and anti-ivory campaigns. All of the following four campaigns leveraged the dissemination and sharing power of shouhudaxiang to both engage and share public support for anti-ivory campaigns widely in China.

Targeting ivory investors

WCS China worked closely with Artron (<http://www.artron.net/> the primary ivory auction and art-investor guide in China) to undertake research into the investment value of ivory and publish a report on the Ivory Carving Auction Market. WCS did not brand this research or report as the purpose is to leverage the influence of this Key Opinion Leader (KOL) to create and disseminate the message. The findings of this research report clearly showed that modern ivory has no investment value and should be shunned by potential art collectors or people seeking a good return on investment. Artron, WCS, CWCA and other partners actively disseminated the findings of the report through the main traditional, investor focused and wider social media platforms in China requesting people to publicly reject ivory investments. An English translation is attached to this report.

Targeting domestic consumers

Following Chinese government's public crush of confiscated ivory in Beijing in May 2015, WCS China's consumer sentiment monitoring showed public concerns about the crush and some significant misunderstanding regarding the reason for stockpile destruction. In response WCS China designed and delivered an online survey to understand the different concerns in greater detail, based on these concerns WCS created and delivered targeted media messages and interactive blogs to respond to different concerns shown in the poll results and generate greater support for destruction of confiscated ivory and a ban on trade.

Targeting online consumers

On World Elephant Day WCS jointly launched an online campaign with one of the main e-commerce platforms in China (DangDang <http://www.dangdang.com/>) to spread the message that online ivory sales are illegal in China, encourage people to upload pictures containing elephants, and make pledges not to bring ivory home to generate conversation and media attention about elephant conservation.

Targeting international travellers

In order to deliver accurate information about the ivory poaching crisis to Chinese travellers and encourage them not to buy ivory, WCS launched an online campaign on social media with the topic of #Don't bring ivory home# during Chinese New Year 2016. In this campaign, WCS reached and interacted with over one hundred thousand medium-high income Chinese consumers and potential travellers who are high-risk for purchasing ivory as souvenirs through campaigns on multiple online platforms.

¹ Currently being updated and moved to a new server location

Activity 1.2

Transform international media content on the elephant crises into materials that are accessible to the general Chinese public through the first comprehensive Chinese-language website on elephants and ivory trade.

Progress

This activity has been fully executed in the manner and timeframe planned. WCS China developed Jiudaxiang (<http://www.jiudaxiang.org/>) to be the first Chinese language website dedicated to educating and informing Chinese people about elephants and the issues affecting elephants around the world. To support this website through this IWT grant the team has identified and translated relevant English language academic, research and media pieces from international news outlets, NGOs and academic institutes into Chinese and shared these through jiudaxiang and WCS social media accounts..

Activity 1.3

Expand social and traditional media coverage on ivory and elephants through the media incubator, a social media based network that will provide technical logistic and editorial support to journalists to influence ivory consumption

Progress

This activity has been fully executed in the manner and timeframe planned. WCS has worked closely with a number of media outlets in China to support journalists to engage in the issue of ivory and poaching in Africa. Media engagement is a vital component of this project as it supports continued public attention on the issue as well as maintaining the awareness of government officials that the ivory poaching crisis is an issue that cannot be ignored. In order to support journalist involvement on ivory and poaching stories WCS China developed the 'Media Incubator', this provides technical, financial and logistical support to enable journalists and investigators to research and develop in-depth reports looking at ivory markets, illegal supply chains, important events and policy announcements.

Activity 1.4

Promote online campaigns to destroy the desirability of ivory through partnerships with online media platforms that provide advertising and feature content on elephants

Progress

This activity has been fully executed in the manner and timeframe planned. WCS China has achieved significant progress through online campaigns over the past twelve months joining hands with private sector partners to develop and launch targeted and influential campaigns through multiple online platforms. Leading media platforms partnered with include DangDang (Chinese version of Amazon), YouKou (Chinese version of Youtube), Weibo (Chinese version of Twitter), Didi Taxi (similar to Uber but with an active online presence).

Output 2

Influential Chinese companies are engaged and mobilised to take action to reduce ivory consumption

Activity 2.1

Coordinate with private sector entities to publicise their statements to stop ivory consumption through social and traditional media in order to reach a broad audience

Progress

This activity has been fully executed in the manner and timeframe planned. WCS China has developed a closely related project called the 'Guardian Award' to support greater private sector engagement and leadership in calling for reduced ivory demand in China. Through this award WCS is using multiple media platforms to publicise the commitments of the companies as well as a large-scale award ceremony in June 2016 in Beijing which will generate significant media interest and engagement. The main pledge website in Chinese can be found here:

<http://www.wcs.org.cn/weishi/?c=photo&a=index>

Activity 2.2

Partner with leading Chinese travel industry actors to secure pledges of Chinese travellers and workers in Africa not to buy ivory

Progress

This activity has been executed in the timeframe planned. WCS China secured the full public pledge of 2 leading Chinese tour operators that they will not facilitate the ivory trade through their business activities or bring ivory home. This includes actively educating and guiding participants of overseas tours away from wildlife purchases.

However, WCS has not conducted African campaigns focussed on workers during this project – instead WCS has focused on travellers and domestic high risk groups in China including young consumers. The reason for not conducting African worker campaigns is because WCS China is currently initiating a new work area focusing on China – Africa investments. We would like to take the opportunity to plan how best to connect demand reduction campaign work in Africa in the longer term to link with this newly emerging work area which is seeking to minimise negative Chinese investment impact on biodiversity in Africa. This will allow the Africa-focused work to be planned and executed within a broader context and with greater long term impact. This is discussed further in a separate change request form.

Activity 2.3

Engage top corporations and strategic industries in the design and implementation of behaviour change campaigns to make ivory undesirable

Progress

This activity has been fully executed in the manner and timeframe planned. WCS China has worked closely with a number of key corporate sector partners over the past 12 months to design and launch specific and targeted behaviour change campaigns. These include partnering with the APM mall in Beijing² to develop and implement a high end art exhibition on elephants and ivory in their flagship Beijing location to target young, fashion conscious consumers as research shows that this demographic is an important in the purchase of illegal ivory in China. Public displays that showcase influential individuals and companies such as the Swire Group (owners of Beijing APM Mall which receives between 80,000 to 100,000 visitors daily) publicly supporting anti-ivory messaging are important to create social momentum toward the tipping point beyond which ivory becomes socially unacceptable and undesirable. Other companies engaged in designing and delivering behaviour change campaigns include DangDang, and Artron.

Output 3 Economic, social and political justifications for further limiting the legal ivory market are provided to government agencies through influential channels and networks

Activity 3.1

Execute long term campaigns with government agencies that support their efforts to reduce the illegal ivory trade

Progress

This activity has been fully executed in the manner and timeframe planned. WCS China has worked closely with CWCA, China Customs and the China Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species (CITES) Management Authority to engage international travellers to Asia and Africa through two 'Voice of China' (VoC) campaigns against tourist consumption of ivory. The event was hosted in the major international airports in Beijing and Nanning. These VoC campaigns promote Chinese leadership and have been co-hosted by Chinese government agencies and WCS regularly at key travel location in recent years.

A separate VoC campaign was also launched targeting domestic consumers in Beijing's APM shopping mall with support from CWCA, the government-supported China Green Carbon Foundation (CGCF) and the Chinese Ministry of Culture.

² http://www.beijingapm.cn/templates/en_second/index.aspx?nodeid=46

Activity 3.2

Coordinate influential partners to present justifications for further limiting the legal ivory market to the government based on 1) the economic drivers and costs of the current limited legal trade model; 2) the overall impact on people who work in the ivory trade; 3) the potential impact on China's global image; 4) overall cost benefit ratio of the ivory trade livelihoods, ecosystems and human security in range states 5) opportunities for sustainable Chinese investment in Africa

Progress

This activity has been fully executed in the manner and timeframe planned. WCS China has convened two international research workshops to date involving a number of highly influential academics, economists and research institutes to support *the economics of the ivory trade* research project designed to support policy making on the domestic ivory trade in China.

The primary research partners are *Beijing Normal University* which is modelling compensation models and the impacts on the Chinese ivory industry. *South African Institute of International Affairs* (SAIIA) is analysing the likely response of illegal ivory stockpilers to the ivory ban. *The School of Law at Wuhan University* focuses on the legality and legal risk of implementing an ivory trade ban based on legal precedent. *Nanjing Forest Police College* is working on the law enforcement implications and cost of ivory ban. *The Department of Economics at the University of Melbourne* works on the impacts of the China ivory trade on African elephant range states from political, economic, and local community livelihood point of views.

These partners have used their political channels and influence to deliver two policy recommendations to the primary policy making body³ of China calling for a total and permanent ban on ivory trade in China.

Activity 3.3

Deliver up to date data on the elephant crises to sensitize director and manager level Chinese government decision makers to the urgent need for policy changes that will limit trade in ivory

Progress

This activity has been fully executed in the manner and timeframe planned. Two policy recommendation proposals for ivory ban policy implementation drafted by the economic study of ivory trade working group were delivered to the China People's Political Consultative Conference (CPPCC) of 2016.

3.2 Progress towards project Outputs

These outputs have been designed to target policy makers, key audiences for ivory consumption and key opinion leaders (KOLs) in China to deliver messaging undermining the prestige and value of ivory. All outputs are on track to be delivered in full by the end of the project, all output indicators are on-track, have already been met or have been exceeded.

Output 1: A greater number of Chinese consumers perceive ivory to be an undesirable product and engage in anti-ivory campaigns to support government action

Indicator 1.1

Conservation of elephants and anti-ivory messaging is one of the top three most popular topics among all environmental topics on the Sina Weibo microblogging site by July 2017, a rise from the 9th ranking in 2013.

Progress

This indicator measures public interest in the issue of ivory and elephants, the assumption is that the Chinese government is influenced by public interest issues in China and generating discussion encourages positive government action. Whilst this indicator does not have an annual target (as measurement requires a large scale data analysis across the Sina Weibo platform with purchased data) the high number of government statements and events relating

³ <http://www.cppcc.gov.cn/zxww/zxyw/home/>

to ivory in China over the project period, including the high profile announcement of the intention to ban ivory trade in China and the USA mean there has been a great deal of discussion on ivory and elephant issues during this project period. It is expected this indicator will be met in full; assessment will be conducted in 2017.

Indicator 1.2

At least 60 articles and multimedia materials on elephants and ivory per year are translated or re-versioned into Chinese and disseminated via WCS online and social media platforms in the project period.

Progress

This indicator directly supports output 1 through educating Chinese consumers on the negative impacts of the ivory trade and has been exceeded. During this reporting period more than 60 articles examining ivory poaching, wildlife trafficking and the role of Asian consumption in driving global demand for wildlife and ivory have been translated into Chinese and shared through WCS online and social media portals.

Indicator 1.3

At least 25 feature reports discussing negative impacts of the ivory trade are produced by journalists joining the Wildlife Conservation Media Incubator (described in activity 1.3) and published on major traditional media outlets during the project period (av. 10 per year)

Progress

This indicator directly supports output 1 through educating Chinese consumers on the negative impacts of the ivory trade and the role of Chinese consumption and has been exceeded. 25 journalists from a number of Tier 1 media outlets (including state owned portals such as China Daily, Xinhua, Southern Weekly, Phoenix Weekly) based in Beijing, Guangzhou and Shanghai have been supported to engage in the issue of ivory and wildlife consumption. The journalists have produced and published a total of 16 articles over the past year (exceeding the performance indicator) reaching over 5 million readers across China (these are not circulation figures but audience figures where this information is available).

Indicator 1.4

10, 000,000 Chinese citizens are 'shared' a range of social and traditional media content about elephant and ivory issues each year.

Progress

This indicator directly supports output 1 through educating Chinese consumers on the negative impacts of the ivory trade and has been exceeded. During this project period the social and traditional media audience for WCS China anti-ivory campaigns, stories, and information is over 17.7 million across social, online and traditional media platforms.

Indicator 1.5

At least 100,000 interactions (likes, retweets comments and clicks) are made on elephants and ivory issues through social and online media each year

Progress

This indicator directly supports output 1 through educating and actively engaging Chinese consumers to understand and reject the ivory trade and has been exceeded. During this reporting period WCS China anti-ivory campaigns and outreach has achieved 132,728 interactions by Chinese netizens.

Indicator 1.6:

Based on a 2014 baseline, raw ivory in Guangzhou (China's primary ivory carving hub) shows a price plateau or decrease by 2017. Additionally, the ETIS Transaction Index records a decreasing trend in recorded shipments of ivory to China from 2014 – 2017.

Progress

This indicator is designed to show demand for ivory, a price fall combined with a supply fall (assuming interdictions remain consistent) should demonstrate lower demand for ivory. This indicator does not have an annual metric and will be assessed in 2017. However, WCS China's monitoring of ivory prices in China indicates that worked ivory has already started to decrease in price in key locations such as Guangzhou. Additional research conducted by Save the Elephants <http://savetheelephants.org/about-ste/press-media/?detail=sharp-fall-in-the-prices-of-ivory-tusks-in-china> shows that from summer 2013 to December 2015 the price of illegal raw ivory almost halved. No recent ETIS reports are available to indicate whether seizures have also fallen, however the fall in prices is a positive trend.

Indicator 1.7

A reduction of 20% by 2017 (from a baseline of 1566 separate trading tweets for ivory between June-November 2013) of ivory trade transactions on Chinese Twitter (Sina Weibo). Sina Weibo has become an important online peer-to-peer trading hub as well as a forum where people publically update others with life events.

Progress

This indicator is designed to measure the volume of illegal ivory sales (all online sales are illegal) and serve as a proxy for demand. This indicator does not have an annual metric (as measurement requires a large scale data analysis across the Sina Weibo platform with purchased data) and will be assessed in 2017.

Output 2: Influential Chinese companies are engaged and mobilised to take action to reduce ivory consumption

Indicator 2.1

100 companies publicly pledge not to bring ivory home by the end of the project period including top 500 companies and companies with high likelihood of impacting ivory consumption

Progress

Corporate engagement is important for a number of reasons, to secure influential people and organisations to 'lead by example' and reject the corporate culture of wildlife consumption and gift giving, to exercise influence over employee behaviour and perceptions, and to modify business practices that can encourage wildlife trafficking. WCS is targeting a variety of industries in order to address all aspects of company engagement outlined above including travel companies, media companies and artistic investment guides.

During this reporting period WCS China has secured the public pledge of 9 companies that they will never purchase ivory or allow it to be purchased by their staff. The wording of the public commitment is:

As a Chinese company, we are leading by example and pledge:

1. To never provide opportunities to trade or advertise illegal wildlife on our business platforms.
2. To never buy or use illegal wildlife products, or send ivory and other illegal wildlife products as a gift.
3. To appeal to our partners, employees and consumers not to buy ivory and other illegal wildlife products.
4. We'll call for more peers and public to join us, to say "NO" to illegal wildlife trade".

This pledging activity is linked to a recently launched 'Guardian Award' campaign and therefore the rate of uptake is expected to increase as this campaign matures. Companies who have pledged to date include influential travel, media and art investors (including CGZL and LUXTRIP travel agencies, Tudou and Youku online media platforms and Artron, the art auction house and investor guide).

Indicator 2.2

50 private sector actors (from for-profit and non-profit / civil society) will provide sponsorship and / or donate resources to anti-ivory behavioural change campaigns each year

Progress

This indicator provides a signal of the importance of ivory and wildlife issues to the private sector in China (and therefore to their main consumer base) and their willingness to support activities through actively donating resources.

This annual target has been exceeded. During this reporting period 51 private sector actors have donated resources to WCS behaviour change campaigns including providing online advertising space, sponsorship for campaigns, volunteers or other financial resources.

Indicator 2.3

10,000,000 people exposed (via foot traffic etc) to on-the ground behavioural change campaigns co-implemented by WCS and corporate partners within the project period

Progress

This indicator provides a signal of the importance of ivory and wildlife issues to the corporate sector in China (and therefore to their main consumer base) and their willingness to support activities through actively working with WCS to design and deliver campaigns and donate resources. It also shows the reach of targeted education and behaviour change campaigns in China during the project period.

Over the reporting period WCS has reached over potential consumers in China. During the initial phase of this IWT project WCS China made a strategic decision to specifically target all behaviour change campaigns to identified consumer groups rather than work through untargeted mass market Public Service Announcements such as posters and billboards on mass transit networks. Targeted groups for the physical on-the-ground campaigns during the first year of this project have been international travellers at airports and high end retail consumers in luxury shopping centres.

Output 3

Economic, social and political justifications for further limiting the legal ivory market are provided to government agencies through influential channels and networks

Indicator 3.1

Findings of 2 research reports with policy justifications published through top 10 social media platforms / top 100 traditional media each year (baseline 1 in 2013)

Progress

This indicator is designed to demonstrate the dissemination to the mass market of research and policy recommendations that support greater ivory trade restrictions based on the assumption that the general public in China have an important role in influencing government policy and that government policy also affects consumer behaviour.

This annual target has been exceeded, links to the reports and social media platforms are provided in the means of verification section below. During this project period the findings of two WCS- led research reports investigating banning the domestic ivory trade in China were published through interviews, opinion pieces and commentaries in both Chinese and English on multiple media platforms. In November 2015, the co-PI from BNU published an article in Nature outlining the findings and recommendations from the research work completed jointly with WCS to date on the best means to implement the proposed ivory ban in China. In December the WCS lead researchers on the economic study of the ivory trade were interviewed by National Geographic regarding the recommendations and findings from the research to date. This article was translated into Chinese and widely disseminated throughout China.

In addition to these reports the WCS-supported Artron research report demonstrating that modern ivory is a poor investment and has no cultural value was also widely disseminated across multiple online and social media platforms in China reaching over 11 million people.

Indicator 3.2

A total of 3 proposals each year calling for restricting the ivory trade are delivered through public channels to the China People's Political Consultative Conference (CPPCC) (baseline 2 in 2014)

Progress

The CPCC is the highest policy making body in China, providing clear, strategically delivered policy recommendations to the CPCC is designed to directly influence policy decisions on ivory in China. This indicator has been met. The WCS-led research on the economics of the ivory trade delivered two policy recommendation proposals to the China People's Consultative Conference (CPCC) of 2016 recommending greater restrictions on the ivory trade. These recommendations were not delivered in the name or under the branding of WCS. In order to maximise the impact of the recommendations WCS China leveraged our extensive network in China to support and deliver proposals to the main decision making body in China on our behalf. In addition to the WCS-led work the Hong Kong Party, Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong (DAB), also delivered proposals calling for bans on the domestic trade in ivory to the CPPCC.

Indicator 3.3

At least 3 government agencies engage in WCS-led campaigns against ivory consumption each year (baseline 0 in 2013)

Progress

This indicator is used as a proxy to demonstrate the level of political and governmental interest in the issue of ivory consumption in China and has been exceeded. Four government agencies and two government-sponsored NGOs in China have actively engaged in WCS-led anti-ivory campaigns during the project period. WCS-led Voice of China (VoC) campaigns in Beijing and Nanning Airports engaged China Customs authorities, China CITES Management Authority, and the Guangxi Government's Anti-Smuggling Division. In Beijing the VoC at APM Mall (reported on above) also involved the Ministry of Culture. Additional government partners include CWCA and the China Green Carbon Foundation, both of which are government-sponsored NGOs in China.

3.3 Progress towards the project Outcome

The outcome indicators for this IWT project all fall within 2017 and for purposes of economy and efficiency do not have annual measurement metrics. However, it is possible to track progress against a majority of the indicators below using proxy data sources. As all output indicators are on track and all outcome indicators with proxy measurements are also on track it is expected that the outcome will be achieved in full.

Outcome: This project will ultimately activate the Chinese public to engage in anti-ivory campaigns, including calling on the Chinese government to take action to significantly undermine the current demand for ivory.

Indicator 1

% of surveyed consumers stating intention to purchase ivory is reduced by 30% by 2017 from a 2012 baseline

Progress

This is an indirect measurement of the level of demand for ivory (indirect as should ivory sales be banned respondents may not be willing to respond honestly) in China and will be measured in 2017.

In 2012 84% of respondents to a National Geographic consumer survey indicated they would buy ivory in the future. The study methodology has not been replicated since this date to provide a direct comparison. However, a 2015 National Geographic consumer survey looked at people who would be likely or unlikely to buy ivory which indicated that 36% of Chinese respondents are 'likely' to purchase ivory. Although this can't be directly compared due to

different methodologies and respondent groups it could be a proxy indicator to show that consumption interest is declining. Given the very large size of the Chinese population, a 36% response rate of likely purchasers remains of great concern.

Indicator 2

Number ivory items sold in domestic auctions decreases by 35% by 2017 from 2014 baseline

Progress

This is a direct measurement of the level of demand for legal ivory in China and will be measured in 2017, however given the May 2015 announcement of the Chinese government to ban ivory sales it is very likely that legal ivory auction sales will fall to near zero when the ban is implemented. It is useful however to track the impact of the announcement on consumer behaviour and whether investors will attempt to divest themselves of ivory products ahead of any trade restrictions on ivory.

WCS China's auction house partner, Artron, provided data which indicated that the number of ivory transactions in 2015 were higher overall than in 2014. However a monthly breakdown shows that from May 2015 the number of ivory transactions fell sharply following the announcement of an ivory ban from the Chinese government. It is expected this trend will continue as it is very unlikely ivory items will be permitted to be sold at auction under the proposed ban.

Indicator 3

Number individuals caught bringing ivory from Africa per bag checked will be reduced by 50% from 2014 levels by 2017

Progress

This is a proxy measurement to show the level of small scale smuggling and the willingness of tourists to risk smuggling ivory into China (and therefore the perception of risk versus reward and value placed on ivory); however, China Customs do not hold this data centrally. WCS is currently examining alternative proxy measurements that could be used to show smuggling levels into China of ivory, including media and enforcement press releases. This indicator does not have an annual metric and will be measured in 2017

Indicator 4

Number Chinese people engaged in WCS led campaigns increases by a factor of 10 by 2017 compared to 2014

Progress

This indicator is used to show the level of willingness of the Chinese public to publicly reject ivory and protect elephants and therefore the likely changes in demand for ivory. Public engagement has been extremely successful over the past year and the 2017 target has already been met. The 2014 baseline is 13,500, the target in 2017 is therefore 135,000 (pledges / interactions / engagements). WCS China has secured over 150,000 engagements from the Chinese public in anti-ivory campaigns over the past year.

Indicator 5

Government increases number of public statements and discussions on reducing domestic ivory trade from a 2014 baseline

Progress

This indicator shows the Chinese government engagement and attention to the issue of ivory and elephants. Research shows that consumer behaviour change in China is closely linked to the perception of legality and the ease of accessing the product in question, therefore government attention and engagement is vital.

This target has been achieved. 2015 was an important year in the advancement of elephant protection through demand reduction in China. In May 2015 the Chinese government completed a second public ivory crush and simultaneously announced their intention to restrict

and phase out the legal domestic trade in ivory in China. This followed a temporary import ban in February 2015 which has been extended in 2016. During this project period two government announcements have been made regarding further restricting the domestic ivory trade in China and five government announcements/statements were made regarding the bans on ivory imports and export as well as ivory hunting trophy imports. In total, there have been 7 public statements and announcements made by the Chinese Government regarding domestic ivory and elephant poaching issues in 2015 from a baseline of zero in 2014.

Sources of data

Indicator 1

A market survey in 2017 with the same scope and target groups as the National Geographic / IFOP market survey from which baseline data were taken

Indicator 2

Monitoring reports on the volume of legal domestic auctions featuring ivory products from Artron, a Chinese art portal and industry service provider.

Indicator 3

China Custom's records and synthesis of media reports of illegal trafficking announced by Chinese law enforcement agencies at the national and provincial levels

Indicator 4

WCS project reports

Indicator 5

Press releases and monitoring reports on policy fora

3.4 Monitoring of assumptions

Outcome risks and important assumptions

1: Government action is the most effective way to reduce ivory consumption

The Chinese government has indicated it is willing to take decisive action on the ivory trade through a domestic commercial ban and continued restrictions on imports. Following the announcement of the ban in May 2015 the price of ivory in China has started to fall, potentially indicating a fall in consumer demand (WCS / BNU / IFAW market monitoring data). This trend indicates this assumption continues to hold true.

2: The Chinese government is committed to combatting the illegal wildlife trade

This assumption still holds true evidenced by the January 2015 ivory crush, the May 2015 ivory crush and announcement of an intention to ban domestic ivory sales, September 2015 joint statement with US President Obama that the ivory trade will be phased out.

3: Anti-ivory campaigns that mobilise citizens directly can achieve greater impact on behaviour that PSA approaches

It is too early in the project to measure whether this assumption holds true, however academic research (for example

<http://www.learningace.com/doc/1648360/0c951c8e031eccdef0a8f83e26afd7b/impact-of-public-service-advertising-research-evidence-and-effective-strategies>) indicates that a PSA style of approach has a low rate of efficacy (5% of viewers) in securing behaviour change.

Output assumptions

1: Chinese consumer behaviour can be influenced by other consumer, media, companies and the government

Marketing research into the largest global consumer market indicates these considerations remain relevant https://www.mckinsey.de/sites/mck_files/files/the-modernization-of-the-chinese-consumer.pdf

2: Government agencies are open to partnering with WCS on public campaigns

This assumption is correct, WCS has partnered with three government agencies in China over the past 12 months on public sensitisation campaigns including Customs, CITES Management Authority and the China Wildlife Conservation Association.

3: The Chinese government is receptive to demonstrations of public support for ivory trade restrictions

This assumption is true as evidenced by the Chinese government announcement in May 2015 that the domestic trade in ivory will be phased out.

4. Impact: achievement of positive impact on illegal wildlife trade and poverty alleviation

Impact: the ivory trade is no longer a threat to the survival of all elephant species

This project is seeking to have a long term impact on the primary driver of the current elephant poaching crisis; demand for illegal ivory in China and thereby reduce the rate of elephants killed for ivory. The project has successfully identified the main consumer groups and what motivational impulses the main groups are likely to respond to (such as peer pressure or government action). Based on this WCS has designed and delivered a number of targeted behaviour change communications, actions and campaigns designed to undermine the specific drivers of demand for ivory, increase public awareness of issues surrounding ivory and elephants and support informed policy making in China.

5. Project support to the IWT Challenge Fund Objectives

This project is focussed on reducing demand for illegal ivory in China as the single largest consumer market. It is building on awareness raising activities undertaken by other NGOs in recent years to deliver targeted behaviour change and anti-ivory campaigns, including calling on the Chinese government to take action. As a result, this project will interrupt a key driver of elephant poaching in Africa, reduce the number of elephants killed, and mitigate the negative impacts of poaching on low income source countries.

6. Impact on species in focus

The project will reduce the demand for ivory in China and thus reduce elephant poaching over the long term. The impact of the project on species will have a significant time lag as consumer behavior changes and affects purchasing decisions and supply chains. The illegal killing of elephants for their ivory is currently the biggest threat to elephants - hence the illegal trade in ivory needs to be tackled throughout the trade chain - from source sites through trade networks and in market countries. Supply side measures (such as protecting key populations from poaching) are essential but insufficient; elephants will never be safe until demand for ivory falls to sustainable levels. This is why it is vitally important to also reduce the demand for ivory in key market countries.

7. Project support to poverty alleviation

The positive support provided to beneficiaries through this project is long term and will not be seen during the life time of this project.

Beneficiaries

The main beneficiaries of reducing demand for ivory are low-income source countries in Africa and Asia and resource dependent communities living near elephant ranges. Elephants are economically important to source countries. They provide a direct source of GDP through tourism and support subsistence livelihoods through maintaining a healthy resource base. Additionally trafficking has a strongly negative impact on the overall governance and security of source countries through encouraging corruption, undermining border security and encouraging the proliferation of arms and armed groups.

Benefits through increased security and sustainability of resources for important industries. High-value wildlife products, such as elephant ivory, are now traded transnationally by well-capitalized criminal syndicates. The involvement of transnational criminal networks in wildlife trade exacerbates socio-economic inequalities by disproportionately affecting low-income communities that depend on functioning ecosystem services for their livelihoods, provoking social conflict, and posing grave threats to the wellbeing of people living in areas where poaching of commercially valuable species occurs. For those communities dependent upon tourism (and especially ecotourism) for their livelihoods, poaching and ivory trafficking can also have significant negative and destabilizing consequences for this economy and the livelihoods tourism supports, both through insecurity (global perception of which has negative impacts on visitor numbers) as well as direct impacts on elephant and other wildlife populations themselves.

Benefits through sustained ecosystem services

Elephants are also important ecosystem managers providing services such as long-distance seed dispersal and control of bush encroachment in arid and semi-arid savannas. Low income communities are highly dependent on functioning ecosystems and the services they provide (such as healthy soil and clean water) as they are unable to afford to purchase inputs such as fertiliser. Reducing demand for elephant ivory will reduce the number of elephants killed, which will in turn enable elephants to maintain their roles as environmental managers, supporting healthy ecosystems and the services that poor communities depend directly on in source countries.

As noted in the original application form it is outside the scope of this project to monitor the impact of the work conducted in China on low income communities in source countries in Africa.

8. Consideration of Gender equity issues

Low income communities and individuals are indirect and long-term beneficiaries of this project as outlined above. Women are important beneficiaries due to their major provisioning role in households in source countries producing food, collecting water, firewood, and often running small businesses. Healthy ecosystems support this provisioning through productive soils, more comprehensive pollination services and providing a natural safety net for households to survive on. It is outside the scope of this project to monitor the impact of the work conducted in China on low income communities and women in source countries in Africa.

9. Monitoring and evaluation

WCS China developed detailed Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) for each output and outcome of this project during the application process; these are outlined in section 3.2 and 3.3 above and have been used over the past 12 months to monitor project progress. No changes have been made to the original M&E plan over this project period and the measurement methods and metrics are outlined in the proposal. The activities, indicators and outputs have a clear logical progression which is explained in section 3 above, working through identified influencers in Chinese society to change the negative purchasing behaviour of the primary retail consumer groups of ivory (travellers, young fashion conscious people and art investors).

10. Lessons learnt

One challenging aspect of this project has been achieving the meaningful engagement of the corporate sector beyond securing donations and resources. Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) objectives are rarely focused on wildlife trade issues in China and WCS therefore needed to construct an incentive package to encourage companies to sign up the binding pledge that they would reject ivory. WCS China created the Guardian Award, a national award scheme to incentivise a variety of actors in China to engage in wildlife protection more effectively. Whilst mainly focused on frontline law enforcement agencies through enabling self-nomination for the annual "China Wildlife Guardian" Award this new campaign also promotes

engagement from leading private sector actors. Lessons learned on this reflect that the corporate CSR environment may not reflect rapid changes in the public or policy priority space and additional incentives are likely to be necessary for meaningful engagement.

A secondary challenge stems from the issues facing international NGOs operating in China. Increasing government attention and oversight of NGO activities has created significant issues in securing necessary partnerships with Chinese civil society and private sector actors who are nervous about working with international NGOs. A solution is to register a local NGO to operate through; this is an ongoing lengthy process that WCS is currently seeking to finalise.

11. Actions taken in response to previous reviews (if applicable)

N/A

12. Other comments on progress not covered elsewhere

WCS has secured seed funding to collaborate with Chinese companies and government partners in targeted African countries to minimise negative biodiversity impacts, including the risk of wildlife trafficking, stemming from Chinese investments. WCS China plans to leverage this emerging program focal area to build greater cross-sectoral and programmatic learning into and from the ivory demand reduction work and coordinate with our African partner offices.

WCS is planning to take the opportunity to connect demand reduction work in the longer term to link with this newly emerging work area. This will allow the demand reduction work to be planned and executed within a broader context and with greater long term impact.

13. Sustainability and legacy

WCS has worked in China for more than 20 years and plans to continue to focus on China as a priority country for wildlife and sustainability issues. The past year has seen significant policy changes in the Chinese government that create a far more conducive working environment for issues looking at wildlife trafficking and ivory. As such, working on ivory related issues in China remains high profile and financially sustainable. Conversely increasing restrictions on the activities of NGOs in China have started to impact the ability of WCS China to create effective partnerships.

14. IWT Challenge Fund Identity

This project is focused on changing consumer behaviour in China through leveraging the influence of groups and individuals such as investment advisors, government agencies and the peers of potential consumers. The campaigns and activities created by WCS are therefore not branded with either the name of WCS or any donor in order to maximise the impact of the message. International funding and NGO activity can be also be a slightly sensitive issue in China.

15. Project Expenditure

Please expand and complete Table 1.

Table 1 Project expenditure during the reporting period (April 2015-March 2016)

| Project spend (indicative) since last annual report | 2015/16 Grant (£) | 2015/16 Total actual IWT Costs (£) | Variance % | Comments (please explain significant variances) |
|--|--------------------------|---|-------------------|--|
| Staff costs (see below) | | | | |
| Consultancy costs | | | | |
| Overhead Costs | | | | |
| Travel and subsistence | | | | |
| Operating Costs | | | | |
| Capital items (see below) | | | | |
| Others (see below) | | | | |
| TOTAL | | | | |

16. OPTIONAL: Outstanding achievements of your project during the reporting period (300-400 words maximum). This section may be used for publicity purposes

I agree for the IWT Secretariat to publish the content of this section (please leave this line in to indicate your agreement to use any material you provide here)

During this project period WCS China has reached and secured the participation of over 150 thousand Chinese people in our online and offline anti-ivory campaigns. These individuals and groups have been targeted specifically as they fall within the 'high-risk' category for ivory consumption based on consumer profiling. Additionally WCS is leading the only Chinese economic study which will provide credible and specific policy recommendations designed to support effective and efficient ivory-ban policy development for the Chinese government. During this project period this research project has convened two international expert working groups and delivered two specific policy briefings outlining the most rational, effective and economic methodology for phasing out the ivory trade in China and removing the ability of smugglers to launder illegal ivory within China.

This research and its potential policy implications are vital for the implementation of a successful ban in China. Providing clear, concise and evidence based approaches to an effective ban from respected Chinese academics and policy actors is key to securing the action that is needed. Options such as a temporary or partial moratorium on ivory sales are likely to be counterproductive and actually spur further poaching in anticipation of future open markets, much in the way that the original CITES 10 year moratorium on ivory sales did following the one off stockpile sale to China and Japan in 2008.

Annex 1: Report of progress and achievements against Logical Framework for Financial Year 2015-2016

| Project summary | Measurable Indicators | Progress and Achievements April 2015 - March 2016 | Actions required/planned for next period |
|---|--|---|--|
| <p>Impact</p> <p>The ivory trade is no longer a threat to the survival of all elephant species</p> | | <p>Following sustained pressure from WCS and NGOs partners the governments of Hong Kong, China and the USA have all announced that the domestic sales of ivory will be further restricted until they can be fully phased out. As significant markets for illegal ivory the closure of these domestic markets and subsequent clarity for enforcement action should have a significant positive impact on poaching rates.</p> | |
| <p>Outcome This project will ultimately activate the Chinese public to engage in anti-ivory campaigns, including calling on the Chinese government to take action to significantly undermine the current demand for ivory.</p> | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. % of surveyed consumers stating intention to purchase ivory is reduced by 30% by 2017 from a 2012 baseline 2. Number ivory items sold in domestic auctions decreases by 35% by 2017 from 2014 baseline 3. Number individuals caught bringing ivory from Africa per bag checked will be reduced by 50% from 2014 levels by 2017 4. Number Chinese people engaged in WCS led campaigns increases by a factor of 10 by 2017 compared to 2014 5. Chinese government increases number of public statements and discussions on reducing domestic ivory trade from a 2014 baseline | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. On track, will be measured in 2017 2. Data show initial increase in sales from January – May and then fall in sales after May 2015. 3. This will be measured in 2017 4. This indicator has already been met 5. This indicator has been met | <p>WCS China will build on the activities and campaigns delivered during the first year to reach a greater number of potential ivory consumers through online and offline campaigns. International travellers, young, high-income fashion conscious consumers, businessmen and art investors have been identified as the main high-risk groups and WCS will design and launch targeted behaviour change campaigns directly and through influential partners targeting each group over the coming year.</p> |

| | | |
|---|--|--|
| <p>Output 1. A greater number of Chinese consumers perceive ivory to be an undesirable product and engage in anti-ivory campaigns to support government action</p> | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Conservation of elephants and anti-ivory messaging is one of the top three most popular topics among all environmental topics on the Sina Weibo microblogging site by July 2017, a rise from the 9th ranking in 2013. 2. At least 60 articles and multimedia materials on elephants and ivory per year are translated or re-versioned into Chinese and disseminated via WCS online and social media platforms in the project period. 3. At least 25 feature reports discussing negative impacts of the ivory trade are produced by journalists joining the Wildlife Conservation Media Incubator (described in activity 1.3) and published on major traditional media outlets (av. 10 per year) 4. 10, 000,000 Chinese citizens are ‘shared’ a range of social and traditional media content about elephant and ivory issues each year. 5. At least 100,000 interactions (likes, retweets comments and clicks) are made on elephants and ivory issues through social and online media each year 6. Based on a 2014 baseline, raw ivory in Guangzhou (China’s primary ivory carving hub) shows a price plateau or decrease by 2017. Additionally, the ETIS Transaction Index⁴ records a decreasing trend in recorded shipments of ivory to China from 2014 – 2017. These are paired as price changes alone cannot show a reduction in demand, a price drop twinned with a restriction in supply should provide a good indicator of demand reduction. 7. A reduction of 20% by 2017 (from a baseline of 1566 separate trading tweets for ivory between June-November 2013) of ivory trade transactions on Chinese Twitter (Sina Weibo). Sina Weibo has become an important online peer-to-peer trading hub as well as a forum where people publically update others with life events. | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. This indicator does not have an annual target, measurement incurs financial costs and this will therefore be measured in 2017 2. This indicator has been exceeded, during the reporting period WCS China identified, translated and disseminated 61 articles and media materials related to elephants, ivory and the poaching crisis. 3. This indicator has been exceeded, WCS China-supported journalists have investigated and published 16 articles over the past year (target 10) 4. This indicator has been exceeded; WCS China has reached an audience of over 17.7 million across China during this project period. 5. This indicator has been exceeded; WCS China campaigns reached and engaged over 150 thousand people during this project period. 6. This indicator does not have an annual metric; however, proxy indicators indicate that the price of ivory has already fallen significantly across China. The ETIS transaction index will be reported against and prices will be confirmed in 2017. 7. This indicator does not have an annual metric and will be assessed in 2017. |
|---|--|--|

⁴ <http://www.plosone.org/article/info%3Adoi%2F10.1371%2Fjournal.pone.0076539>

| | | | |
|--|---|---|---|
| <p>Activity 1.1 Design innovative interactive social media campaigns which are tailored for use through portable devices and promote and capture direct public commitment not to bring ivory home</p> | <p>This activity was fully executed during the reporting period and is ongoing. WCS will continue to build on experience and expand our reach to more partners and platforms over the coming year with more targeted campaigns</p> | | |
| <p>Activity 1.2 Transform international media content on the elephant crises into materials that are accessible to the general Chinese public through the first comprehensive Chinese-language website on elephants and ivory trade.</p> | <p>This activity was fully executed during the reporting period and is ongoing, with the identification, translation and dissemination of well researched media pieces through multiple online platforms to support greater understanding among Chinese consumers of the impact of ivory trading.</p> | | |
| <p>Activity 1.3 Expand social and traditional media coverage on ivory and elephants through the media incubator, a social media based network that will provide technical logistic and editorial support to journalists to influence ivory consumption</p> | <p>This activity was fully executed during the reporting period and is ongoing; the media incubator was designed and successfully supported 16 in-depth reports during the reporting period. This will continue to support high quality Chinese journalism with a focus on ivory and wildlife trade issues in the coming period.</p> | | |
| <p>Activity 1.4 Promote online campaigns to destroy the desirability of ivory through partnerships with online media platforms that provide advertising and feature content on elephants</p> | <p>This activity was fully executed during the reporting period and will be expanded during the next project period.</p> | | |
| <table border="1"> <tr> <td data-bbox="107 743 472 1198"> <p>Output 2. Influential Chinese companies are engaged and mobilised to take action to reduce ivory consumption</p> </td> <td data-bbox="472 743 1180 1198"> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 100 companies publicly pledge not to bring ivory home by the end of the project period including top 500 companies and companies with high likelihood of impacting ivory consumption 2. 50 private sector actors (from both for-profit and non-profit / civil society) will provide sponsorship and / or donate resources to anti-ivory behavioural change campaigns each year 3. 10, 000,000 people exposed (via foot traffic etc) to on-the ground behavioural change campaigns co-implemented by WCS and corporate partners within the project period </td> </tr> </table> | <p>Output 2. Influential Chinese companies are engaged and mobilised to take action to reduce ivory consumption</p> | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 100 companies publicly pledge not to bring ivory home by the end of the project period including top 500 companies and companies with high likelihood of impacting ivory consumption 2. 50 private sector actors (from both for-profit and non-profit / civil society) will provide sponsorship and / or donate resources to anti-ivory behavioural change campaigns each year 3. 10, 000,000 people exposed (via foot traffic etc) to on-the ground behavioural change campaigns co-implemented by WCS and corporate partners within the project period | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. This indicator is progressing steadily and the uptake rate is expected to increase over the coming project period with the maturation of the linked Wildlife Guardian Award incentive scheme. To date 9 influential companies have publicly pledged they will never support ivory consumption or enable it to happen through their business practices. 2. This indicator has been exceeded; during this reporting period 51 private sector actors have engaged in WCS campaigns and donated resources. 3. This indicator is progressing steadily with 1.64 million people reached through WCS physical campaigns during this project period. |
| <p>Output 2. Influential Chinese companies are engaged and mobilised to take action to reduce ivory consumption</p> | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 100 companies publicly pledge not to bring ivory home by the end of the project period including top 500 companies and companies with high likelihood of impacting ivory consumption 2. 50 private sector actors (from both for-profit and non-profit / civil society) will provide sponsorship and / or donate resources to anti-ivory behavioural change campaigns each year 3. 10, 000,000 people exposed (via foot traffic etc) to on-the ground behavioural change campaigns co-implemented by WCS and corporate partners within the project period | | |
| <p>Activity 2.1 Coordinate with private sector entities to publicise their statements to stop ivory consumption through social and traditional media in order to reach a broad audience</p> | <p>This activity was fully executed during the reporting period and will be further expanded during the next project period through the expansion of the linked 'Wildlife Guardian Award' project. This is more fully reported in section 3.1 above.</p> | | |
| <p>Activity 2.2 Partner with leading Chinese travel industry actors to secure pledges of Chinese travellers and workers in Africa not to buy ivory</p> | <p>This activity was executed during the reporting period and is ongoing. This is more fully reported in section 3.1 above.</p> | | |

| | |
|--|---|
| Activity 2.3 Engage top corporations and strategic industries in the design and implementation of behaviour change campaigns to make ivory undesirable | This activity was fully executed during the reporting period and is ongoing. This is more fully reported in section 3.1 above. |
| <p>Output 3. Economic, social and political justifications for further limiting the legal ivory market are provided to government agencies through influential channels and networks</p> | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Findings of 2 research reports with policy justifications published through top 10 social media platforms / top 100 traditional media each year (baseline 1 in 2013) 2. A total of 3 proposals each year calling for restricting the ivory trade are delivered through public channels to the China people's Consultative Conference (baseline 2 in 2014) 3. At least 3 government agencies engage in WCS-led campaigns against ivory consumption each year (baseline 0 in 2013) |
| Activity 3.1 Execute long term campaigns with government agencies that support their efforts to reduce the illegal ivory trade | This activity was fully executed during the reporting period and is ongoing. More information is available in section 3.1 above |
| Activity 3.2 Coordinate influential partners to present justifications for further limiting the legal ivory market to the government based on 1)the economic drivers and costs of the current limited legal trade model; 2) the overall impact on people who work in the ivory trade; 3) the potential impact on China's global image; 4) overall cost benefit ratio of the ivory trade livelihoods, ecosystems and human security in range states 5) opportunities for sustainable Chinese investment in Africa | This activity was fully executed during the reporting period and is ongoing. More information is available in section 3.1 above |
| Activity 3.3 Deliver up to date data on the elephant crises to sensitize director and manager level Chinese government decision makers to the urgent need for policy changes that will limit trade in ivory | This activity was fully executed during the reporting period and is ongoing. More information is available in section 3.1 above |

Annex 2 Logframe

Also included as a separate Excel file for legibility and size

| | Project summary | Measurable Indicators | Means of Verification | Assumptions / Risks |
|------------|--|---|---|---|
| Impact | The ivory trade is no longer a threat to the survival of all elephant species | | | |
| Outcome | This project will ultimately activate the Chinese public to engage in anti-ivory campaigns, including calling on the Chinese government to take action to significantly undermine the current demand for ivory. | 1. % of surveyed consumers stating intention to purchase ivory is reduced by 30% by 2017 from a 2012 baseline | A market survey in 2017 with the same scope and target groups as the National Geographic/IFOP market survey from which baseline data were taken. | Government action is the most effective way to reduce ivory consumption, especially to make it illegal to purchase ivory under any circumstances (National Geographic/IFOP study). |
| | | 2. Number ivory items sold in domestic auctions decreases by 35% by 2017 from 2014 baseline | Monitoring reports on the volume of legal domestic auctions featuring ivory products from Artron, a Chinese art portal and industry service provider (http://www.artron.net/). | In line with official statements made during the 2013 London summit, the Chinese government is committed to combating the illegal wildlife trade. |
| | | 3. Number individuals caught bringing ivory from Africa per bag checked will be reduced by 50% from 2014 levels by 2017 | China Customs' records and synthesis of media reports of illegal trafficking announced by Chinese law enforcement agencies at the national and provincial levels (Shanghai, Beijing and Guangzhou). | Anti-ivory campaigns that mobilize citizens directly through interactive social media tools can achieve greater impact on consumer behavior than traditional Public Service Announcements approaches. |
| | | 4. Number Chinese people engaged in WCS led campaigns increases by a factor of 10 by 2017 compared to 2014 | WCS project reports | |
| | | 5. Govt increases number of public statements and discussions on reducing domestic ivory trade from a 2014 baseline | Press releases and monitoring reports on policy fora | |
| Output 1 | A greater number of Chinese consumers perceive ivory to be an undesirable product and engage in anti-ivory campaigns to support government action | 1. Conservation of elephants and anti-ivory messaging is one of the top three most popular topics among all environmental topics on the Sina Weibo microblogging site by July 2017, a rise from the 9 th ranking in 2013. | Reports on CIC social media monitoring analyses | Chinese consumer behavior can be influenced by other consumers, media, corporate actors and the government. |
| | | 2. At least 60 articles and multimedia materials on elephants and ivory per year are translated or re-versioned into Chinese and disseminated via WCS online and social media platforms in the project period. | Project monitoring reports on targeted social media platforms, traditional media channels and online portals | |
| | | 3. At least 25 feature reports discussing negative impacts of the ivory trade are produced by journalists joining the Wildlife Conservation Media Incubator (described in activity 1.3) and published on major traditional media outlets (av. 10 per year) | | |
| | | 4. 10,000,000 Chinese citizens are 'shared' a range of social and traditional media content about elephant and ivory issues each year. | ETIS reports and market surveys in Guangzhou | |
| | | 5. At least 100,000 interactions (likes, retweets comments and clicks) are made on elephants and ivory issues through social and online media each year | | |
| | | 6. Based on a 2014 baseline, raw ivory in Guangzhou (China's primary ivory carving hub) shows a price plateau or decrease by 2017. Additionally, the ETIS Transaction Index(1) records a decreasing trend in recorded shipments of ivory to China from 2014 – 2017. These are paired as price changes alone cannot show a reduction in demand, a price drop twinned with a restriction in supply should provide a good indicator of demand reduction. | | |
| | | 7. A reduction of 20% by 2017 (from a baseline of 1566 separate trading tweets for ivory between June-November 2013) of ivory trade transactions on Chinese Twitter (Sina Weibo) Sina Weibo has become an important online peer-to-peer trading hub as well as a forum where people publically update others with life events. | Reports on CIC and online monitoring | |
| Activities | Activity 1.1 Design innovative interactive social media campaigns which are tailored for use through portable devices and promote and capture direct public commitment not to bring ivory home | Project monitoring reports, links to campaigns, online engagement | Project monitoring reports on targeted social media platforms, traditional media channels and online portals | |
| | Activity 1.2 Transform international media content on the elephant crises into materials that are accessible to the general Chinese public through the first comprehensive Chinese-language website on elephants and ivory trade. | Project monitoring, links to reports | | |
| | Activity 1.3 Expand social and traditional media coverage on ivory and elephants through the media incubator, a social media based network that will provide technical logistic and editorial support to journalists to influence ivory consumption | Links to online campaigns, screen shots | | |
| | Activity 1.4 Promote online campaigns to destroy the desirability of ivory through partnerships with online media platforms that provide advertising and feature content on elephants | | | |
| Output 2 | Output 2. Influential Chinese companies are engaged and mobilised to take action to reduce ivory consumption | 1. (100 companies publicly pledge not to bring ivory home by the end of the project period including top 500 companies and companies with high likelihood of impacting ivory consumption | Project monitoring reports and evaluations of activities; Media reports and company data (website, press releases, etc.) | Chinese consumer behavior can be influenced by other consumers, media, corporate actors and the government. |
| | | 2. 60 private sector actors (from both for-profit and non-profit / civil society) will provide sponsorship and / or donate resources to anti-ivory behavioural change campaigns each year | | |
| Activities | Activity 2.1 Coordinate with private sector entities to publicise their statements to stop ivory consumption through social and traditional media in order to reach a broad audience | Project monitoring reports, media resources from campaigns | | |
| | Activity 2.2 Partner with leading Chinese travel industry actors to secure pledges of Chinese travellers and workers in Africa not to buy ivory | | | |
| | Activity 2.3 Engage top corporations and strategic industries in the design and implementation of behaviour change campaigns to make ivory undesirable | | | |
| Output 3 | Output 3. Economic, social and political justifications for further limiting the legal ivory market are provided to government agencies through influential channels and networks | 1. Findings of 2 research reports with policy justifications published through top 10 social media platforms / top 100 traditional media each year (baseline 1 in 2013) | Links to reports | The Chinese government is receptive to demonstrations of public support for greater restrictions on the ivory trade. |
| | | 2. A total of 3 proposals each year calling for restricting the ivory trade are delivered through public channels to the China people's Consultative Conference (baseline 2 in 2014) | Project monitoring reports on targeted social media platforms, traditional media channels and online portals | |
| | | 3. At least 3 government agencies engage in WCS-led campaigns against ivory consumption each year (baseline 0 in 2013) | Research reports and proposals on ivory trade policy submitted | |
| Activities | Activity 3.1 Execute long term campaigns with government agencies that support their efforts to reduce the illegal ivory trade | Project monitoring reports on targeted social media platforms, traditional media channels and online portals | | |
| | Activity 3.2 Coordinate influential partners to present justifications for further limiting the legal ivory market to the government based on 1)the economic drivers and costs of the current limited legal trade model; 2) the overall impact on people who work in the ivory trade; 3) the potential impact on China's global image; 4) overall cost benefit ratio of the ivory trade livelihoods, ecosystems and human security in range states 5) opportunities for sustainable Chinese investment in Africa | Policy recommendations delivered | The Chinese government is receptive to demonstrations of public support for greater restrictions on the ivory trade. | |
| | Activity 3.3 Deliver up to date data on the elephant crises to sensitize director and manager level Chinese government decision makers to the urgent need for policy changes that will limit trade in ivory | | | |

Annex 3 Standard Measures

In future years it is our intention to develop a series of standard measures in order to collate some of the quantitative measures of activity, input and output of IWT projects. These will not be measures of the impact or effectiveness of IWT projects but will contribute to a longer term dataset for Defra to draw upon. The collection of standard measures data will be important as it will allow us to understand the combined impact of all the UK Government funded Challenge Fund projects. This data will therefore provide useful information for the Defra Secretariat and for Defra Ministers regarding the Challenge Fund.

The standard measures for the IWT Challenge Fund are currently under development and it is therefore not necessary, at present, to complete this Annex. Further information and guidance about the IWT standard measures will follow.

Annex 4 Onwards – supplementary material (optional but encouraged as evidence of project achievement)

Checklist for submission

| | Check |
|---|-------|
| Is the report less than 10MB? If so, please email to IWT-Fund@ltsi.co.uk putting the project number in the subject line. | |
| Is your report more than 10MB? If so, please discuss with IWT-Fund@ltsi.co.uk about the best way to deliver the report, putting the project number in the subject line. | |
| Have you included means of verification? You need not submit every project document, but the main outputs and a selection of the others would strengthen the report. | |
| Do you have hard copies of material you want to submit with the report? If so, please make this clear in the covering email and ensure all material is marked with the project number. | |
| Have you involved your partners in preparation of the report and named the main contributors | |
| Have you completed the Project Expenditure table fully? | |
| Do not include claim forms or other communications with this report. | |